

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING
AMENDED AGENDA (WITH AGREEMENT OF J. HENRY LIEVENS,
DAVID SWARTOUT, DAVID VENSEL, AND JAY HEINZERLING)
MONROE COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS
THURSDAY, APRIL 10, 2025 at 5:30 P.M.
125 EAST SECOND STREET — MONROE, MI 48161
(734) 240-7003

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

Henry Lievens-Chairman, Jay Heinzerling, Greg Moore, Jr.,
David Swartout and David Vensel

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. ROLL CALL
- III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE
Led by Commissioner Heinzerling
- IV. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (03/13/2025)
- VI. COMMITTEE BUSINESS
 - 1. Property Assessed Clean Energy (PACE) Program Presentation
 - 2. Letter dated March 17, 2025 from Mr. David L. Robinson, Monroe City Manager, requesting a \$1,000,000 contribution to the West Elm Avenue Rail Grade Separation Project for the remaining unfunded local match requirement.
 - 3. Letter dated March 14, 2025 from Sheriff Troy Goodnough, requesting the addition of an additional Sergeant position to the existing staffing plan.
 - 4. Letter dated April 3, 2025 from Ms. Donna Kuti, Dispatch Director, requesting the addition of two (2) additional full-time 9-1-1 dispatchers and two (2) part-time 9-1-1 dispatchers to the current approved staffing levels.
 - 5. Letter dated March 28, from Mr. Jeff McBee, Human Resources Director, requesting the reclassification of the Courthouse Security being placed on the Non-Union Wage Scale.
 - 6. MIDC Feasibility Study
 - 7. Probate Court Security Discussion
 - 8. St. Joseph Center for Hope Emergency Funding.
 - 9. Courts request to allow Court Recorders to use the Printing Department to produce transcripts with the Court Recorders reimbursing the County for the production costs.

10. Monroe County Bar Association Historical Pictures Displayed.

VII. NEW BUSINESS - None

VIII. OLD BUSINESS –

1. Standing Ethics Committee Discussion

IX. CITIZENS TIME

X. INFORMATION - None

XI. COMMISSIONERS TIME

XII. ADJOURNMENT

MONROE COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS
OPERATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES
MARCH 13, 2025 AT 5:45 P.M.

I. The Meeting of the Operations Committee of the Monroe County Board of Commissioners was held in the Board Chambers in the City of Monroe on Thursday, March 13, 2025. Chairman Lievens called the meeting to order at 5:45 p.m.

II. Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk, Robin Miller as follows:
PRESENT: Jay Heinzerling, J. Henry Lievens, and David Vensel, and David Swartout

ABSENT: Greg Moore Jr. (Excused)

A quorum being present, the Operations Committee was able to conduct business.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE— Chairman Lievens led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (03/15/2025)

Motion by Commissioner Heinzerling, supported by Commissioner Swartout to approve the March 13, 2025 Agenda with an amendment to add the reclassification of a temporary part time position to a permanent part time position in the probation department to agenda item one under Committee Business.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (12/10/2024)

Motion by Commissioner Vensel, supported by Commissioner Swartout to approve the December 10, 2024 minutes of the Operations Committee as presented and waive the reading thereof.

Voice vote taken. Motion carried.

VI. COMMITTEE BUSINESS

1. Letter dated February 10, 2025, from Chief Judge Michael Brown, 1st District Court, requesting approval to add one (1) full-time Probation Officer position, reclassify the Jail Alternative Work Service (JAWS) Coordinator position from a grade 7 to a grade 9, and reclassify the Part-Time JAWS Monitor position from a grade 3 to a grade 5. Also, the reclassification of the temporary part-time Pretrial Services Treatment

Coordinator position to a permanent part-time Pretrial Services Treatment Coordinator.

Motion by Commissioner Heinzerling, supported by Commissioner Swartout to accept the communication, place it on file, and recommend to the full Board to approve adding one (1) full-time Probation Officer position, reclassifying the JAWS Coordinator position at grade 9, reclassifying the Part-Time JAWS Monitor at grade 5, and reclassifying the temporary part-time Pretrial Services Treatment Coordinator position to a permanent part-time position. Further, recommend a supplemental appropriation up to \$92,382.00 from the 2025 County Contingency Account to fund the amount not covered by the 1st District Court 2025 budget.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

- Letter dated February 5, 2025, from Prosecuting Attorney, Jeffery Yorkey, requesting the authorization of adding an additional Senior Trial Attorney classification to the existing staffing plan.

Motion by Commissioner Swartout, supported by Commissioner Heinzerling to accept the communication, place it on file, and recommend to the full Board to approve the authorization of adding an additional Senior Trial Attorney classification to the existing staffing plan. Further, recommend a supplemental appropriation up to \$18,757.00 from the 2025 County Contingency Account to fund the amount not covered by the Prosecuting Attorney's Office 2025 budget.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

- Letter dated February 7, 2025, from Jail Administrator, Julie Massengill, requesting to place the Red Shirt Coordinator on the non-union wage scale at a classification of grade 9.

Motion by Commissioner Heinzerling, supported by Commissioner Swartout to accept the communication, place it on file, and recommend to the full Board to approve the classification of the Red Shirt Coordinator at grade 9 on the non-union wage scale.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

4. Letter dated March 5, 2025, from Information Technology Director, Jacob Perry, requesting approval to reclassify the grade 6 Printer position to a grade 8 Multimedia Technician.

Motion by Commissioner Vensel, supported by Commissioner Heinzerling to accept the communication, place it on file, and recommend to the full Board to approve reclassifying the grade 6 Printer position to a grade 8 Multimedia Technician. Further, recommend a supplemental appropriation up to \$6,570.00 from the 2025 County Contingency Account to fund the amount not covered by the Information Technology 2025 budget.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

5. Letter dated February 7, 2025, from Human Resources Director, Jeff McBee, requesting approval to reclassify the Parks Maintenance Leader from a grade 7 to a grade 9.

Motion by Commissioner Heinzerling, supported by Commissioner Swartout to accept the communication, place it on file, and recommend to the full Board to approve reclassifying the Parks Maintenance Leader from a grade 7 to a grade 9. Further, recommend a supplemental appropriation up to \$8,350.00 from the 2025 County Contingency Account to fund the amount not covered by the Purchasing and Property Maintenance 2025 budget.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
-----	--	-----	---------

J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

6. Business Alliance/ARPA Infrastructure Discussion.

TC Clements, Chief Executive Officer of the Monroe County Business Alliance, explained they are the Economic Development Organization for the County of Monroe. Stated they are the first point of contact when anything comes through the state or federal channels and also the first point of contact for outside businesses. Mr. Clements explains the power of the alliance is the who. He stated they have an amazing team and they deserve the credit. He then elaborated on what they do. They attract new large-scale industrial development and retain existing businesses with support. They also connect local businesses to new development, create community connectivity, and link (plan 2.0) to quality of life for better success. He further explained why doing this is so important. He shared many statistics including, 84% of businesses in this County have nineteen (19) or less employees. 64% of businesses in this County have less than ten (10) employees.

Mr. Clements explained the ARPA projects to date and stated they all are on time to meet their deadlines. The projects are listed below.

Frenchtown (F1): Sanitary improvements to increase capacity in N Dixie/I-75 area
 Frenchtown (F2): Install 500K water tower to provide additional flow/water pressure
 Dundee (D1): Remediation of sanitary system serving Dundee Industrial Area (I&I)
 Dundee (D2): Improvements to WWTP to increase capacity and efficiency
 Dundee (D3): Water main replacement and extension along M50 to Village boundary
 Dundee (D4): New force main & pump station west of US-23

Further discussion was held.

7. Letter dated March 5, 2025, from Information Technology Director, Jacob Perry, requesting approval of Policy #811, Acceptable Use of Artificial Intelligence.

Motion by Commissioner Vensel, supported by Commissioner Heinzerling to accept the communication, place it on file, and recommend to the full Board to approve Policy #811, Acceptable Use of Artificial Intelligence.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

8. Letter dated March 3, 2025, from Human Resources Director, Jeff McBee, requesting approval of revised Policy #452, Paid Personal/Sick Leave.

Motion by Commissioner Swartout, supported by Commissioner Heinzerling to accept the communication, place it on file, and recommend to the full Board to approve revised Policy #452, Paid Personal/Sick Leave.

Roll call by Chief Deputy County Clerk as follows:

AYE		NAY	EXCUSED
J. Henry Lievens	Jay Heinzerling		Greg Moore Jr.
David Swartout			
David Vensel			

Motion carried.

9. Courthouse Security/Compensation/Board Room Use Discussion.

Discussion was held. Chairman Lievens explained the security procedures we have in place. Recommendation to allow other groups to use the Board room if they provide the organization their schedule so the necessary adjustments can be made. He further explained that the back door that smokers would use is no longer kept open unless there is a delivery being made. Which after said delivery, the doors are locked back up.

Motion by Chairman Lievens, supported by Commissioner Swartout to recommend to the full Board to refer courthouse security compensation to Human Resources for its report to come back at reasonable time.

Voice vote taken. Motion carried.

10. Standing Ethics Committee Discussion.

Chairman Lievens stated the investigation has begun since the firm has been retained. They are working with County financial to secure the retainer. There will be more to develop later.

VI. NEW BUSINESS – None

VII. OLD BUSINESS – None

VIII. CITIZENS TIME –

1. Rick Kull: Thanked the board for their recommendation to allow outside groups to meet in the chambers. Mr. Kull explained he called ahead of time to schedule the room for the entire year in advance. Mr. Kull also said he understands the security concerns.

Chairman Lievens explained there will be a public meeting space in the Museum once they finish their current project that all groups will be welcome to use as well.

2. Alan VanWashenova: Explained how townships and communities are growing and thanked the Board for helping them grow. Stated he wants to continue moving forward and they cannot do that without the Board. Mr. VanWashenova thanked them again.
- IX. INFORMATION – Chairman Lievens explained this weekend is the Bedford Trade Fair and then Ducks Unlimited is later in the evening.
- X. COMMISSIONERS TIME –
- Commissioner Heinzerling – Explained the Materials Management Planning Committee met today and forwarded a grant to the state. Looking forward to hearing back.
- Commissioner Moore – Excused.
- Commissioner Swartout – Passed.
- Commissioner Vensel – Thanked Commissioner Asper for creating an ethics resolution. Stated he appreciated the work of everyone and there is more to come as far as establishing a standing ethics committee.
- Chairman Lievens – Passed.
- XI. ADJOURNMENT – With no further business, Chairman Lievens adjourned the meeting at 6:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:



Grace Drewior
Deputy Clerk/Administrative Assistant
Monroe County Board of Commissioners



Office of the City Manager
David L. Robinson

TO: Michael Bosanac March 17, 2025
Monroe County Administrator/ Chief Financial Officer

FROM: David Robinson
City Manager, City of Monroe

SUBJECT: Official Request for Funding
West Elm Avenue Rail Grade Separation Project

The City of Monroe holds a very important and unique transportation position within southeast Michigan and Monroe County, in that we are served by an interstate highway, three state trunklines, and a total of three Class 1 Railroads that are generally oriented in a north-south direction.

Due to the orientation of these at-grade railroad crossings, there are no east-to-west vehicle traffic travel paths that are not impeded by railroad crossings. The city has a region-wide challenge of maintaining a healthy and safe traffic flow at a moderate level of service while accommodating rail traffic which is crucial to the international supply chain and our region's economy. At times, when the traffic flow of vehicular traffic is halted as a result of long, slow or stopped trains, the traffic situation becomes chaotic for city and county residents alike.

In 2022, the city contracted for a feasibility study that resulted in identifying the at-grade crossing located on West Elm Avenue as being the crossing that would provide the most benefit to the region as well as the location that would most likely score significantly high as a federal grant funding project through Section 22305 of the 2021 Bipartisan Infrastructure law. The city and its consultants worked to compile and submit an application to secure funding through the U.S. Department of Transportation/Federal Railroad Administration that would fund 80% of the \$30 million project. On June 7, 2023, the city was awarded \$23,964,400 in federal grant funding which was one of the top ten highest funded projects nationally.

Receiving a federal grant of this magnitude to address an issue that affects the city, county, and surrounding region is monumental. However, while 80% of the total project is funded, the city continues to our efforts to secure the remaining 20% local match requirement as funding the local match by ourselves would cause significant strain on our responsibility to also improve and maintain the city's overall local road network. However, we also recognize we cannot let the possibly once-in-a-generation

opportunity to complete this project that is majority funded by our federal partners pass us by.

Of the approximate \$6 million of local match need, CSX Railroad has a 5% statutory contribution, or \$1.5 million, of the project's total cost. The city has successfully secured an additional \$2 million in funding through a grant from the Michigan Infrastructure Office Technical Assistance Center.

Using rounded numbers for simplicity:

Total Project Estimate:	\$30,000,000
U.S. FRA Grant:	\$24,000,000
Total Local Match Requirement:	\$6,000,000
CSX Statutory Contribution	\$1,500,000
Michigan Infrastructure Office Grant	\$2,000,000
Unsecured Funding needed	\$2,500,000

As noted above, the present remaining unfunded local match amount is \$2.5 million and the city is continuing our diligent efforts to seek and secure other partnerships to satisfy the local match need.

This project serves not only the city and its residents, it also serves the overall county and the region, so we are officially requesting a funding partnership with the county to achieve the current unfunded local match requirement.

As demonstrated in our successful funding application, West Elm Avenue is a critical thoroughfare used by many motorists from the wider county. In recognition of the greater benefit this project provides to the safety and well-being of county residents, the city is respectfully requesting a contribution of \$1,000,000 toward the remaining unfunded local match requirement. This investment, matched by a \$1,500,000 commitment by the city, will ensure the successful completion of this project and provide substantial benefits to the entire region by reducing traffic congestion, improving emergency response times, and enhancing overall transportation efficiency.

It is our hope that the County of Monroe administration and the Monroe County Board of Commissioners recognize the significance of the city securing \$24,000,000 of federal infrastructure funding for our community, but also the value of this project to the city, the county, and the region as a whole.

Respectfully,



David Robinson
City Manager

Cc: David Vensel - Commissioner (District 6) Chairman
Brian Lamour - Commissioner (District 5)



MONROE COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE

Troy Goodnough, Sheriff

100 East Second Street, Monroe, MI 48161-2163

Telephone: (734) 240-7400 • Fax: (734) 240-7480

March 14, 2025

Mr. Henry Lievens, Vice Chairman
Monroe County Board of Commissioners
Operations Committee
125 East Second Street
Monroe, MI 48161

Re: Additional Sergeant Position

Dear Mr. Lievens

We are requesting approval to create an additional sergeant position to address the increasing demands of the Michigan Commission on Law Enforcement Standards (MCOLES), Michigan Sheriffs' Coordinated and Training Council (MSCTC), the Continuing Professional Education (CPE) curriculum requirements and overall training for all Sheriff's Office employees.

As MCOLES and MSCTC continue to expand training requirements and professional development standards, our organization must ensure full compliance while maintaining operational efficiency to serve the community. The additional sergeant will allow us to effectively manage training coordination, policy adherence, and record keeping, thereby ensuring that all officers meet mandated standards without disrupting daily operations.

This position will be instrumental in overseeing training hours, tracking certifications, and ensuring personnel remain current with evolving law enforcement practices. Given the increasing administrative burden associated with maintaining compliance, this role is essential for operational readiness. Timely and accurate training and associated recordkeeping is critical to maintaining MCOLES and MSCTC licensing for all deputies and correction officers. The position will ensure all documentation meets regulatory standards and annual audit guidelines.

Additionally, the sergeant will play a key role in the hiring process. This position will assist the chief deputy in managing all MCOLES and MSCTC-related pre-employment documentation and ensuring proper entry into the MCOLES and MSCTC portals. The complexity and time required for these tasks have increased significantly, making dedicated oversight necessary. The sergeant will also coordinate police academy enrollment, ensuring candidates meet all requirements and are properly equipped before attending the academy. The sergeant will serve as a resource for our recruits helping them with expectations, guiding them as they go through the academy and helping ensure a smooth on-boarding and transition to road or corrections duties after graduation.



MONROE COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE

Troy Goodnough, Sheriff

100 East Second Street, Monroe, MI 48161-2163

Telephone: (734) 240-7400 • Fax: (734) 240-7480

The position will prepare the organization for accreditation and annual evaluations to maintain accreditation certification. Accreditation is going to be a requirement to seek Federal Grant funding in the future. Our office must be prepared to begin the accreditation process and then the full year to complete and receive accreditation. The position will maintain the Sheriff's Office website to ensure current and relevant information is available to the public.

The additional sergeant position will assist in other areas including filling in as road patrol front line supervisor when needed to cover vacations / training days and other shortages to reduce overtime costs and importantly maintain acceptable citizen response times. We respectfully seek your concurrence for this critical position.

This position is not currently funded. We would seek to have it funded from the County General Fund. The expected annual cost is as follows:

Wages:
\$90,558

Fringes:
\$70,027

Total:
\$160,585

Sincerely,

Troy Goodnough,
Sheriff

HIRING REVIEW FORM

Department: Sheriff's Office

Vacancy Job Title: Sergeant

Brief Job Description:

Under the supervision of a Lieutenant or other command officer, supervises deputies engaged in providing law enforcement services, conducting criminal investigations, policing accident scenes, and responding to citizen complaints.

Budgeted Position:

☐ YES

If YES, are Funds Available?

☐ YES

* Must be verified by Finance/HR

☐ NO

*Must provide Funding Plan, verified by

☒ NO

If NO, please provide the following:

Job Description (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Point Factoring (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Reorganization Plan (When applicable)

Funding Plan Required, Verified by Finance (Include Finance Worksheet)

Department Summary: (Importance of filling vacancy, risks, timing, etc.)

We are requesting the approval to create this additional position to address the increasing demands of the Michigan Commission on Law Enforcement Standards (MCOLES), Michigan Sheriffs' Coordinated and Training Council (MSCTC), the Continuing Professional Education (CPE) curriculum requirements and overall training for all Sheriff's Office employees.

Completed By: Troy Goodnough, Sheriff DATE: 3/14/2025

Human Resources/ Finance Use:

Conclusion:

Finance: The requested position would require a projected 2025 General Fund additional appropriation of between \$79,067 and \$115,496 dependent upon the experience of the backfilled deputy position.

HR: The request is in compliance with the collective bargaining agreement and County policies.

Finance Reviewer: Sue Maier DATE: 4/3/2025

HR Reviewer: Jeff McBee DATE: 4/3/2025

APPROVED BY THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

APPROVED BY THE FULL BOARD

Monroe County Sergeant

<u>Department:</u>	<u>Sheriff's Office</u>	<u>Wage Grade:</u>	<u>NA</u>
<u>FLSA Status:</u>	<u>Non-Exempt</u>	<u>Affiliation:</u>	<u>COAM - Command</u>

General Summary:

Under the supervision of a Lieutenant or other command officer, supervises deputies engaged in providing law enforcement services, conducting criminal investigations, policing accident scenes, and responding to citizen complaints. Assists the Shift Lieutenant in supervising all activities on an assigned shift and acts as Shift Commander in the absence of the Lieutenant.

Essential Functions: *[An employee in this position may be called upon to do any of the following essential functions. These examples do not include all of the duties which the employee may be expected to perform. To perform this job successfully, an individual must be able to perform each essential function satisfactorily]*

- Assists with assigning patrol areas, ensures adequate staffing for daily services and special events, observes and counsels officers on job performance, participates in performance evaluations, and otherwise assists the Lieutenant in supervising shift operations.
-
- Provides direct information to command staff for daily roll-call briefings and ensures the communication of information pertinent to officers and staff.
-
- Performs the duties of inspecting deputies, officers and civilian staff daily uniform, assigned equipment, patrol vehicles and other department equipment for cleanliness, policy compliance and proper function.
-
- In the absence of a Lieutenant, provides appropriate command notifications to the on call staff member.
-
- Monitors and responds to road patrol activities on an ongoing basis and makes adjustments as dictated by the number and type of calls received to ensure that each area of the County is receiving adequate patrol coverage.
-
- Reviews field operations by on-the-road monitoring of officers performance. Provides direct coaching, guidance and on the job training to deputies, officers and civilian staff.
-
- Provides advice and assistance to deputies, officers and civilian staff on various law enforcement issues and specific case problems.
-

- Responds to the scene of all major crimes and serious accidents to ensure they are handled and documented properly. Directs activities at such incidents unless relieved by a higher-ranking officer, or bureau commander.
-
- In the absence of a Lieutenant reviews reports, video and related daily paperwork of deputies, officers and civilian staff for accuracy, completeness, adherence to rules and regulations, and use of proper investigative techniques. Advises deputies, officers and civilian staff of apparent deficiencies and determines if further investigation, bureau assistance or follow-up is necessary.
-
- In the absence of, or at the direction of a Lieutenant, reviews and investigates citizen complaints regarding deputies, officer or staff conduct. Conducts random checks with complainants to determine their level of satisfaction with employee performance.
-
- Assists in the training of newly assigned deputies, officers and civilian staff. Oversees and monitors on-the-job training and may serve as Field Training Shift Supervisor and/or coordinator of the field officer training program.
-
- In the absence of a Lieutenant, assists in the administrative tasks of the shift, such as maintaining payroll records and leave day records.
-
- May be assigned to the Detective Bureau with responsibility for supervising a unit of officers assigned as Detectives.
-
- May be assigned to the responsibility of supervising the Marine Division, including employee(s) assigned to Marine Division.
-
- May be assigned to Traffic/Administrative Division with responsibility of supervising the Traffic Services Division, Records Division and Civil Division.
-
- Monitors proper use and function of employee assigned equipment and facilitates the issuance of new equipment, along with repair and replacement of malfunctioning equipment.
-
- In the absence of a Lieutenant, may prepare press releases regarding significant events, progress on investigations and other matters of public interest.
-
- May be called upon and required to respond to incidents outside of regularly scheduled work hours regarding specialized investigative assistance.
-
- Maintains acceptable level of daily citizen contacts and proactive police activity through self-initiation and community policing techniques.
-
- Performs the duties of a Deputy Sheriff as necessary, including patrol, original complaint investigations, and accident investigations.

** The Detective Sergeant and Traffic/Administrative Sergeant will have additional duties outlined in a separate document, of which will be supplied.

This list may not be inclusive of the total scope of job functions to be performed. Duties and responsibilities may be added, deleted or modified at any time.

EMPLOYMENT STANDARDS (as published under the authority of P.A. 203 of 1965):

Age and Citizenship: Must be at least 18 years of age and a United States Citizen.

Education: A High School Diploma or equivalent is required.

Drivers License: The applicant must possess a valid operator's license.

Drug Testing: Applicant will be screened for the use of illegal controlled substances. This testing will be completed after the conditional offer of employment.

Good Moral Character: Possess a good moral character as determined by a favorable comprehensive background investigation covering school and employment records, home environment, and personal traits and integrity. Consideration will be given to all criminal and civil law violations as indicating lack of good character.

Employment Qualifications:

Education: High School graduation or equivalent. Prefer advanced coursework in police administration, criminal justice, or related areas.

Experience: Five years experience as Deputy Sheriff with Monroe County Sheriff's Office.

Other Requirements:

Certification by the Michigan Commission on Law Enforcement Officers Standards.

Knowledge of:

- Relevant equipment, policies, procedures, and strategies to promote effective local, state, or national security operations for the protection of people, data, property, and institutions.
- Laws, legal codes, court procedures, precedents, government regulations, executive orders, agency rules, and the democratic political process.
- Structure and content of the English language including the meaning and spelling of words, rules of composition, and grammar.
- Management principles involved in strategic planning, resource allocation, human resources modeling, leadership technique, and coordination of people and resources.
- Human behavior and performance; individual differences in ability, personality, and interests; learning and motivation.
- Principles and processes in providing personal services. This includes needs assessment, meeting quality standards for service, and evaluation of satisfaction.

Skill in:

- Giving full attention to what other people are saying, taking time to understand the points being made, asking questions as appropriate, and not interrupting at inappropriate times.
- Motivating, developing, and directing people as they work, identifying the best people for the job.
- Monitoring and assessing performance of yourself and other individuals to make improvements or take corrective action.
- Managing one's own time and the time of others.
- Using logic and reasoning to identify strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions or approaches to problems.
- Being aware of others' reactions and understanding why they react as they do.
- Bringing others together and trying to reconcile differences, persuading others to change their minds or behavior.
- Adjusting actions in relation to others actions.
- Talking to others to convey information effectively, and actively looking for ways to help.
- Use of firearms.

Ability to:

- Tell when something is wrong or is likely to go wrong.
- Apprehend, subdue and control individuals who require physical intervention.
- Communicate information and ideas in both speaking and in writing so others will understand.
- Combine pieces of information to form general rules or conclusions.
- Listen, read and understand information and ideas presented through spoken words and in writing.
- Complete job duties on an independent basis.

The qualifications listed above are intended to represent the minimum skills and experience levels associated with performing the duties and responsibilities contained in this job description. The qualifications should not be viewed as expressing absolute employment or promotional standards, but as general guidelines that should be considered along with other job-related selection or promotional criteria.

Physical Requirements: *[This job requires the ability to perform the essential functions contained in this description. These include, but are not limited to, the following requirements. Reasonable accommodations will be made for otherwise qualified applicants unable to fulfill one or more of these requirements]:*

Must be in good physical condition such as to permit the occasional lifting and carrying of objects or persons, standing, walking or running for extended periods of time.

- Must be able to pass physical and psychological examinations. 🖥️ Ability to enter and access information from a computer.
- Vision to read printed materials and a computer screen.
- Hearing and speech sufficient to communicate in person or over the telephone.
- May drive a County or personal vehicle in the course of the work.

Working Conditions:

Performs duties under a variety of environmental conditions including office assignment and travel throughout the County during all types of weather conditions. . May travel throughout the State or out of State. Shift work assignments include weekend and day, afternoon and midnight shifts according to assigned schedule.

ITEM	DATE	Department	Union	Classification	WAGES	FRINGES	TOTAL
ANNUAL BUDGET	2025	30100	union_01	DETECTIVE	\$ 81,451	\$ 64,600	\$ 146,051
ANNUAL BUDGET	2025	30100	union_01	DEPUTY	\$ 78,828	\$ 69,430	\$ 148,258
				TOTAL BUDGET	\$ 160,279	\$ 134,030	\$ 294,309
ACTUAL COST	THROUGH 5/4/25	30100	union_01	DETECTIVE	\$ 32,811	\$ 24,380	\$ 57,191
ACTUAL COST	THROUGH 5/4/25	30100	union_01	DEPUTY	\$ 30,564	\$ 14,146	\$ 44,710
				TOTAL ACTUAL	\$ 63,375	\$ 38,526	\$ 101,901
				REMAINING BUDGET	\$ 96,904	\$ 95,504	\$ 192,408
PROPOSED	PROMO EFFECTIVE 5/5/25	30100	union_09	SERGEANT	\$ 59,982	\$ 46,229	\$ 106,211
PROPOSED	PROMO EFFECTIVE 5/5/25	30100	union_01	DETECTIVE	\$ 53,649	\$ 47,038	\$ 100,686
PROPOSED	DOH: 5/5/25 STEP 1	30100	union_01	DEPUTY	\$ 42,337	\$ 22,240	\$ 64,577
				PROPOSED COST-STEP 1	\$ 155,968	\$ 115,507	\$ 271,475
				TOTAL COST/(SAVINGS) STEP 1	\$ 59,064	\$ 20,003	\$ 79,067
PROPOSED	PROMO EFFECTIVE 5/5/25	30100	union_09	SERGEANT	\$ 59,982	\$ 46,229	\$ 106,211
PROPOSED	PROMO EFFECTIVE 5/5/25	30100	union_01	DETECTIVE	\$ 53,649	\$ 47,038	\$ 100,686
PROPOSED	DOH: 5/5/25 STEP 5	30100	union_01	DEPUTY	\$ 64,217	\$ 36,790	\$ 101,007
				PROPOSED COST-STEP 4	\$ 177,848	\$ 130,057	\$ 307,904
				TOTAL COST/(SAVINGS) STEP 4	\$ 80,944	\$ 34,552	\$ 115,496
FINANCE CONCLUSION:							
ADDITIONAL COST TO GENERAL FUND, WOULD REQUIRE ADDITIONAL APPROPRIATION.							
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025	30100	union_09	SERGEANT	\$ 90,558	\$ 70,027	\$ 160,585
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025	30100	union_01	DETECTIVE	\$ 80,903	\$ 71,152	\$ 152,055
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025 STEP 1	30100	union_01	DEPUTY	\$ 51,025	\$ 24,137	\$ 75,162
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025 STEP 4	30100	union_01	DEPUTY	\$ 77,487	\$ 39,768	\$ 117,255



MONROE COUNTY CENTRAL DISPATCH

987 S. Raisinville Rd. • Monroe Michigan 48161-2164

(734) 243-7070 • Fax (734) 241-5820

9-1-1 • Police • Fire / Rescue • EMS

April 3, 2025

Commissioner J. Henry Lievens
Monroe County Operations Committee
125 East Second Street
Monroe, MI 48161

Re: Additional Personnel: Part - Time 9-1-1 Dispatcher (2)
Full - Time 9-1-1 Dispatcher (2)

Dear Chairman Lievens and Committee Members:

At the regular meeting of the 9-1-1 District Board held on March 18, 2025 discussion was held regarding my request to add two (2) additional full-time 9-1-1 dispatchers and two (2) part-time 9-1-1 dispatchers to our current approved staffing levels. The request for part-time dispatchers requires the creation of a new Part-Time 9-1-1 Dispatcher (non-union) position. A Motion to authorize me, Donna Kuti, to send this request to the Operations Committee was made by Commissioner Hoffman with support by Director Tolstedt.

911 and public safety technology is constantly changing with the goals to become more efficient, to improve call location accuracy, shorten call times, and improve on scene response times. Additionally, there is public safety technology to integrate systems for information sharing and improve interoperability between agencies. Technology designed to provide the most proper and accurate medical and fire safety instructions to citizens, and digital resources at our fingertips to provide scene safety information to responders and citizens alike.

Advancements in 911 technology have changed the way 911 dispatchers answer and process calls. Dispatching is no longer just answering a telephone, entering information into a computer, and dispatching the information over the radio. The number of programs utilized to process and dispatch calls adds extra levels of complexity to call taking and dispatching. More time is required to assess and respond to each call. However, with all the improved technology resources available to dispatch, the expectations on dispatchers have also increased.

To meet these expectations and manage the ever evolving technology, it's necessary to consider the restructuring of our current dispatching model. At present, our dispatchers are not only the radio dispatcher but call taker as well; simultaneously performing two job functions while utilizing required technology resources. It is not unusual for a dispatcher to be on a 911 call providing medical instructions to a caller and have to pause in giving those instructions in order to dispatch out a domestic police call to law enforcement, all while keeping the 911 caller on the line. The dispatcher then returns to the caller to continue with the medical instructions while keeping an ear on the police radio for any important updates or information.

In order to maximize the use of new technology resources and provide better service to the community I believe it is important to employ additional dispatchers to move toward a separation of "call taker" and



radio “dispatcher” functions. On a base level, the call taker would answer the phone, process calls for service, and provide situationally appropriate life-saving instructions, (such as CPR instructions). The dispatcher would then be responsible for dispatching the call to the appropriate personnel and manage requests for resources and ensure first responder safety. Separating tasks would allow one dispatcher’s primary attention to remain on the citizen and another dispatcher’s to remain on the first responder. Adding additional dispatchers would also allow supervisors to actually take on the role of the Supervisor and monitor the room as a whole, assist other dispatchers in the room, monitor emergency channels, coordinate resources for responders, etc., and fully execute other Supervisor job duties.

Adding two full time dispatchers and two part time dispatchers is a stepping stone in the direction of separating the job functions of call taker and dispatcher. Additionally, extra personnel will add assistance during peak call hours and assist with coverage during call offs or scheduled time off, lessening the times employees work forced overtime beyond their scheduled work hours on their scheduled days off. Also, it’s likely we will always see some sort of turnover. Unfortunately with turnover, there remains a hole in shifts that need to be covered by overtime and on call. Adding extra personnel will assist as a buffer in staffing coverage until we can hire and train successfully which can take as long as 6 months or more.

A healthy work-life balance is what employees’ desire and that need carries over to Dispatch. A satisfied, knowledgeable, and experienced team is essential to Dispatch success. In the Dispatch environment the best experience and knowledge comes with longevity. If we can provide a stable environment where our dispatchers are satisfied and we can foster longevity and decrease employee burnout the ultimate benefit will be to our citizens and first responders.

Detailed job descriptions are attached for your reference along with cost calculations. At this time, Central Dispatch is funded entirely from a 911 surcharge and this request is able to be funded within the revenue collected from the surcharge. There is no obligation to the General Fund.

I am respectfully requesting the Operations Committee recommend approval of the Request to Hire regarding the two additional full-time 9-1-1 Dispatcher positions as well as the approval of the creation of the part-time 9-1-1 Dispatcher position and subsequent Request to Hire.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Donna L. Kuti".

Donna L. Kuti,
Director

Copy: Troy Goodnough, 9-1-1 District Board Chairman
Michael G. Bosanac, County Administrator/Chief Financial Officer
Jeff McBee, Director of Human Resources

MISSION STATEMENT

“To coordinate Law-Enforcement, Fire, and EMS emergency service requests in Monroe County for the safety and protection of our citizens and public safety providers. Through our actions, we help save lives, protect property, assist the public in their time of need and proudly know that we made a difference.”

HIRING REVIEW FORM

Department: Central Dispatch

Vacancy Job Title: 9-1-1 Dispatcher

Brief Job Description:

Under the supervision of a 911 Dispatch Supervisor, utilizing various technology resources, receives calls and dispatches law enforcement officers, fire departments, and emergency medical services throughout Monroe County. Maintains radio communications with patrol units, operates a LEIN terminal, searches and provides necessary information to officers.

Budgeted Position:

☐ YES

If YES, are Funds Available?

☐ YES

* Must be verified by Finance/HR

☐ NO

*Must provide Funding Plan, verified by

☒ NO

If NO, please provide the following:

Job Description (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Point Factoring (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Reorganization Plan (When applicable)

Funding Plan Required, Verified by Finance (Include Finance Worksheet)

Department Summary: (Importance of filling vacancy, risks, timing, etc.)

I am requesting the approval of two (2) full-time 911 dispatcher positions for the 9-1-1 Operations Center to be hired in budget year 2026, or sooner, if applicable. These positions would operate on an overlapping relief schedule typically during busy call times. As relief the schedule shifts to cover scheduled employee time off. The additional support will assist other calltakers/dispatchers with increasing work load and processes.

Completed By: Donna L. Kuti, Director DATE: 04/02/2025

Human Resources/ Finance Use:

Conclusion:

Finance Conclusion: Fund has sufficient fund balance to absorb the anticipated cost.

HR: The request is in compliance with the collective bargaining agreement and County policies.

Finance Reviewer: Sue Maier

DATE: 4/3/2025

HR Reviewer: Jeff McBee

DATE: 4/3/2025

APPROVED BY THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

APPROVED BY THE FULL BOARD

MONROE COUNTY 9-1-1 DISPATCHER

<u>Department:</u>	<u>Central Dispatch</u>	<u>Wage Grade:</u>	<u>Rye - 9</u>
<u>FLSA Status:</u>	<u>Non-Exempt</u>	<u>Affiliation:</u>	<u>POAM</u>

GENERAL SUMMARY:

Under the supervision of a 9-1-1 Dispatch Supervisor, the purpose of this position is to receive requests for police, fire and emergency medical assistance from the public and dispatch these requests to the appropriate agencies.

ESSENTIAL FUNCTIONS: *[An employee in this position may be called upon to do any of the following essential functions. These examples do not include all of the duties which the employee may be expected to perform. To perform this job successfully, an individual must be able to perform each essential function satisfactorily.]*

- Answers all incoming emergency 911 calls and non-emergency calls; collects and accurately records and communicates pertinent information on all aspects of the nature of incident and status, suspect description, locations, and other pertinent information.
- Simultaneously performs various tasks while in reception of multiple audio and visual sources (radio channels, talk groups, computer monitors, etc.) This includes answering multiple telephone lines and monitoring radio traffic from multiple responders.
- Operates a Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) computer system, inputs accurate and timely information, including location, caller information, codes, and comments, routes calls in a timely manner; operates a variety of computer systems to assist emergency service responders.
- Maintains professional voice tones during emergency and non-emergency conditions.
- Communicates with citizens from diverse cultural backgrounds who often vary in age and mental acuity and who may be under the influence of alcohol or drugs.
- Operates radio equipment and related technology needed to dispatch appropriate units by priority and availability; maintains familiarity with different radio frequencies and talk groups; communicates with responders using appropriate voice tones, and syntax.

- Monitors the status of all responders; maintains situational awareness of multiple incidents at assorted locations simultaneously.
- Operates the Law Enforcement Information Network (LEIN) to obtain information on subjects, vehicles, and other information to relay to responders; enters/cancels warrants, orders, stolen vehicles, missing persons and maintains related files.
- Answers non-emergency calls and accurately responds to a diverse number of inquiries from the public; directs calls to appropriate agencies; records appropriate information as deemed necessary.
- Operates a variety of other equipment associated with dispatch center operations; monitors security doors and cameras, public notification systems, and various radio and computer systems.
- Activates appropriate emergency services systems in the event of a disaster, including weather warning alert system, Fermi Nuclear Plant, and media notice.
- May be assigned as the trainer for newly hired Communications Specialists, includes assisting newly hired employees in acquiring all the knowledge and skills necessary to perform the job satisfactorily and evaluating the progress and making recommendations on their continued employment.

This list may not be inclusive of the total scope of job functions to be performed. Duties and responsibilities may be added, deleted or modified at any time.

EMPLOYMENT QUALIFICATIONS:

Education:

High school diploma or equivalent.

Experience:

Data entry and computer use experience preferred; prior work experience with public safety dispatching desired.

Licenses and Certifications:

- Must possess a valid driver's license.
- Must maintain performance certifications and minimum training standards required by State and Federal guidelines, including EMD/CPR certifications.
- Within 24 months from date of hire, shall complete *Module One and Two*, a 40-hour telecommunicator training course approved by the State 9-1-1 Committee.

Other Requirements:

- Must complete Michigan LEIN operator training.
- Maintain LEIN/NCIC fingerprint clearance.
- Pursue continuous professional development for current trends in communications/dispatch and emergency service practices.

Knowledge of:

- Local roads, streets, and jurisdictional boundaries, locations of local hospitals, schools, public and private buildings, roadway constructions locations and detours.
- Relevant equipment, policies, procedures, and strategies to promote effective local, state, or national safety operation for the protecting of people, data, property and institutions.
- Laws, legal codes, government regulations, agency rules and regulations.
- Knowledge of principles and processes for providing customer and personal services, including needs assessment.

Skills in:

- Giving full attention to what others are saying, taking time to understand the information being relayed, asking questions if appropriate, and not interrupting at inappropriate times.
- Being able to prioritize situations and information, making appropriate decisions on when to self-initiate or seek guidance or assistance from a supervisor.
- Actively looks for ways to help people and relays information to them in a clear manner, being aware of others' reactions and understanding why they react as they do.
- Using logic and reasoning to identify the strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions or approaches to problems.

Ability to:

- Type 30 words per minute.
- Communicate information and ideas in writing and speech so others will understand.
- Listen to and understand information and ideas presented through spoken words and sentences.
- Combine pieces of information to form general conclusions, often times under different levels of stress, circumstances and time frames.
- Concentrate on a variety of tasks at the same time while maintaining a professional demeanor.
- Work in a team and independently, accepting criticism and coaching from supervisors and peers.

[The qualifications listed below are intended to represent the minimum skills and experience levels associated with performing the duties and responsibilities contained in this job description. The qualifications should not be viewed as expressing absolute employment or promotional standards, but as general guidelines that should be considered along with other job-related selection or promotional criteria.]

Physical Requirements: *[This job may require the ability to perform any of the essential functions contained in this description. These may include, but are not limited to, the following requirements. Specific requirements for a job will be identified at the time of employment. Reasonable accommodations will be made for otherwise qualified applicants unable to fulfill one or more of these requirements]:*

- Hearing and speech sufficient to communicate in person or over the telephone.
- Vision to read printed materials, multiple computer monitors and distinguish colors.
- Ability to use a variety of electronic equipment.
- Ability to withstand prolonged periods of sitting.
- Ability to climb, bend, stoop, lift 25 lbs, carry, push a cart and work in a normal office setting and use standard office equipment including a computer.
- May drive a County or personal vehicle in the course of the work.

Working Conditions:

- Works in dispatch center and office environment.
- Works in an area with telecommunications equipment for prolonged periods.
- Varying shifts in a 24-hour a day operation to include weekends, holidays and irregular hours.
- Compensated mandatory overtime is required.
- High-stress environment, above-average noise level and sudden change in activity levels.
- Lunch and breaks periods cannot be scheduled.
- May be required to travel to other locations within and outside of Monroe County

HIRING REVIEW FORM

Department: Central Dispatch

Vacancy Job Title: Part-Time 9-1-1 Dispatcher

Brief Job Description:

Under the supervision of a 911 Dispatch Supervisor, utilizing various technology resources, receives calls and dispatches law enforcement officers, fire departments, and emergency medical services throughout Monroe County. Maintains radio communications with patrol units, operates a LEIN terminal, searches and provides necessary information to officers.

Budgeted Position:

☐ YES

If YES, are Funds Available?

☐ YES

* Must be verified by Finance/HR

☐ NO

*Must provide Funding Plan, verified by

☒ NO

If NO, please provide the following:

Job Description (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Point Factoring (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Reorganization Plan (When applicable)

Funding Plan Required, Verified by Finance (Include Finance Worksheet)

Department Summary: (Importance of filling vacancy, risks, timing, etc.)

I am requesting the approval of two (2) part-time 911 dispatcher positions for the 9-1-1 Operations Center to be hired in budget year 2025. The positions would be filled by persons with a minimum of two years experience in Monroe County 911 dispatch systems. The positions would offer additional staffing coverage for overtime, training, special assignments, weather, high volume hours, etc. with a focus of adding support to assist call takers/dispatchers with increased work loads and processes.

Completed By: Donna L. Kuti, Director DATE: 04/02/2025

Human Resources/ Finance Use:

Conclusion:

Finance: Fund has sufficient fund balance to absorb the anticipated cost.

HR: The request is in compliance with County policies.

Finance Reviewer: Sue Maier DATE: 4/3/2025

HR Reviewer: Jeff McBee DATE: 4/3/2025

APPROVED BY THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

APPROVED BY THE FULL BOARD

MONROE COUNTY

PART-TIME 9-1-1 DISPATCHER

Department: Central Dispatch

Wage Grade: Rye - 9

FLSA Status: Exempt

Affiliation: Non-Union

GENERAL SUMMARY:

Under the supervision of a 9-1-1 Dispatch Supervisor, the purpose of this position is to receive requests for police, fire and emergency medical assistance from the public and dispatch these requests to the appropriate agencies.

ESSENTIAL FUNCTIONS: *[An employee in this position may be called upon to do any of the following essential functions. These examples do not include all of the duties which the employee may be expected to perform. To perform this job successfully, an individual must be able to perform each essential function satisfactorily.]*

- Answers all incoming emergency 911 calls and non-emergency calls; collects and accurately records and communicates pertinent information on all aspects of the nature of incident and status, suspect description, locations, and other pertinent information.
- Simultaneously performs various tasks while in reception of multiple audio and visual sources (radio channels, talk groups, computer monitors, etc.) This includes answering multiple telephone lines and monitoring radio traffic from multiple responders.
- Operates a Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) computer system, inputs accurate and timely information, including location, caller information, codes, and comments, routes calls in a timely manner; operates a variety of computer systems to assist emergency service responders.
- Maintains professional voice tones during emergency and non-emergency conditions.
- Communicates with citizens from diverse cultural backgrounds who often vary in age and mental acuity and who may be under the influence of alcohol or drugs.
- Operates radio equipment and related technology needed to dispatch appropriate units by priority and availability; maintains familiarity with different radio frequencies and talk groups; communicates with responders using appropriate voice tones, and syntax.

- Monitors the status of all responders; maintains situational awareness of multiple incidents at assorted locations simultaneously.
- Operates the Law Enforcement Information Network (LEIN) to obtain information on subjects, vehicles, and other information to relay to responders; enters/cancels warrants, orders, stolen vehicles, missing persons and maintains related files.
- Answers non-emergency calls and accurately responds to a diverse number of inquiries from the public; directs calls to appropriate agencies; records appropriate information as deemed necessary.
- Operates a variety of other equipment associated with dispatch center operations; monitors security doors and cameras, public notification systems, and various radio and computer systems.
- Activates appropriate emergency services systems in the event of a disaster, including weather warning alert system, Fermi Nuclear Plant, and media notice.

This list may not be inclusive of the total scope of job functions to be performed. Duties and responsibilities may be added, deleted or modified at any time.

EMPLOYMENT QUALIFICATIONS:

Education:

High school diploma or equivalent.

Experience:

Minimum two-years experience in Monroe County Central Dispatch systems; certifications preferred.

Licenses and Certifications:

- Must possess a valid driver's license.
- Must maintain performance certifications and minimum training standards required by State and Federal guidelines, including EMD/CPR certifications.
- Within 24 months from date of hire, or before certification expiration, shall complete/maintain State 9-1-1 Committee required training courses.

Other Requirements:

- Must complete Michigan LEIN operator training.
- Maintain LEIN/NCIC fingerprint clearance.
- Pursue continuous professional development for current trends in communications/dispatch and emergency service practices.

Knowledge of:

- Local roads, streets, and jurisdictional boundaries, locations of local hospitals, schools, public and private buildings, roadway constructions locations and detours.
- Relevant equipment, policies, procedures, and strategies to promote effective local, state, or national safety operation for the protecting of people, data, property and institutions.
- Laws, legal codes, government regulations, agency rules and regulations.
- Knowledge of principles and processes for providing customer and personal services, including needs assessment.

Skills in:

- Giving full attention to what others are saying, taking time to understand the information being relayed, asking questions if appropriate, and not interrupting at inappropriate times.
- Being able to prioritize situations and information, making appropriate decisions on when to self-initiate or seek guidance or assistance from a supervisor.
- Actively looks for ways to help people and relays information to them in a clear manner, being aware of others' reactions and understanding why they react as they do.
- Using logic and reasoning to identify the strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions or approaches to problems.

Ability to:

- Type 30 words per minute.
- Communicate information and ideas in writing and speech so others will understand.
- Listen to and understand information and ideas presented through spoken words and sentences.
- Combine pieces of information to form general conclusions, often times under different levels of stress, circumstances and time frames.
- Concentrate on a variety of tasks at the same time while maintaining a professional demeanor.
- Work in a team and independently, accepting criticism and coaching from supervisors and peers.

[The qualifications listed below are intended to represent the minimum skills and experience levels associated with performing the duties and responsibilities contained in this job description. The qualifications should not be viewed as expressing absolute employment or promotional standards, but as general guidelines that should be considered along with other job-related selection or promotional criteria.]

Physical Requirements: *[This job may require the ability to perform any of the essential functions contained in this description. These may include, but are not limited to, the following requirements. Specific requirements for a job will be identified at the time of employment. Reasonable accommodations will be made for otherwise qualified applicants unable to fulfill one or more of these requirements]:*

- Hearing and speech sufficient to communicate in person or over the telephone.
- Vision to read printed materials, multiple computer monitors and distinguish colors.
- Ability to use a variety of electronic equipment.
- Ability to withstand prolonged periods of sitting.
- Ability to climb, bend, stoop, lift 25 lbs, carry, push a cart and work in a normal office setting and use standard office equipment including a computer.
- May drive a County or personal vehicle in the course of the work.

Working Conditions:

- Works in dispatch center and office environment.
- Works in an area with telecommunications equipment for prolonged periods.
- Varying shifts in a 24-hour a day operation.
- High-stress environment, above-average noise level and sudden change in activity levels.
- Lunch and breaks periods cannot be scheduled.
- May be required to travel to other locations within and outside of Monroe County.

ITEM	DATE	Department	Union	Classification	WAGES	FRINGES	TOTAL
PROPOSED	DOH: 6/30/25	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 25,487	\$ 12,332	\$ 37,819
PROPOSED	DOH: 6/30/25	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 25,487	\$ 12,332	\$ 37,819
PROPOSED	DOH: 6/30/25	32500	PartTime	PART-TIME 911 DISPATCHER	\$ 17,397	\$ 1,656	\$ 19,053
PROPOSED	DOH: 6/30/25	32500	PartTime	PART-TIME 911 DISPATCHER	\$ 17,397	\$ 1,656	\$ 19,053
				TOTAL COST/(SAVINGS)	\$ 85,767	\$ 27,977	\$ 113,744
FINANCE CONCLUSION:							
ADDITIONAL COST TO FUND 261; FUND HAS SUFFICIENT FUND BALANCE TO ABSORB ANTICIPATED COST.							
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 50,988	\$ 27,817	\$ 78,805
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 50,988	\$ 27,817	\$ 78,805
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025	32500	PartTime	PART-TIME 911 DISPATCHER	\$ 34,794	\$ 3,312	\$ 38,106
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025	32500	PartTime	PART-TIME 911 DISPATCHER	\$ 34,794	\$ 3,312	\$ 38,106

ITEM	DATE	Department	Union	Classification	WAGES	FRINGES	TOTAL
PROPOSED	DOH: 1/1/26	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 54,335	\$ 29,161	\$ 83,496
PROPOSED	DOH: 1/1/26	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 54,335	\$ 29,161	\$ 83,496
PROPOSED	DOH: 1/1/26	32500	PART-TIME	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 43,310	\$ 4,123	\$ 47,432
PROPOSED	DOH: 1/1/26	32500	PART-TIME	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 43,310	\$ 4,123	\$ 47,432
				TOTAL COST/(SAVINGS)	\$ 195,289	\$ 66,568	\$ 261,857
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2026	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 54,335	\$ 31,084	\$ 85,419
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2026	32500	union_12	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 54,335	\$ 31,084	\$ 85,419
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2026	32500	PART-TIME	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 43,310	\$ 4,123	\$ 47,432
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2026	32500	PART-TIME	911 DISPATCHER	\$ 43,310	\$ 4,123	\$ 47,432



Jeff McBee
Human Resources Director
Telephone (734) 240-7251
Confidential Fax
(734) 240-7299

MONROE COUNTY

HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

125 East Second Street · Monroe, Michigan 48161- 2110
Telephone (734) 240-7295 · Fax (734) 240-7266 · Toll Free (888) 354-5500 Ext 7295

Sarah A. Boden
Human Resources Coordinator
Telephone (734) 240-7253
Confidential Fax
(734) 240-7276

Sierra Masson
Human Resources Assistant
Telephone (734) 240-7301
Confidential Fax
(734) 240-7302

March 28, 2025

Commissioner J. Henry Lievens
Chairperson, Operations Committee
Monroe County Board of Commissioners
125 East Second Street
Monroe, Michigan 48161

Re: Classification of Courthouse Security on the Non-Union Wage Scale

Dear Commissioner Lievens and Operations Committee Members:

This letter serves as a request for your consideration of approval of the classification of the Courthouse Security position on the non-union wage scale. Currently, this position is compensated at a rate of \$24.72 per hour, regardless of time in the position. To provide some history, the security officer position was placed at a flat rate of \$20.00 per hour in 2018 and remained at that rate until 2021. Since 2021, there have been annual increases between 4% and 5%. By officially classifying the position on the wage scale, this will bring a degree of certainty for current and perspective employees, along with a recognition of continued service due to the introduction of increased compensation for time in the position.

Following a review of the job description and responsibilities of this position, a point factoring analysis resulted in classifying the position as a Grade 8. For 2025, this would result in the following wage schedule, with annual increases consistent with the non-union employee group (a 3% increase in 2026):

Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6
22.51	23.30	24.12	24.96	25.83	26.73

Because all of our current security officers (and likely future security officers) have retired from a career in law enforcement, they would be placed on at least step 5 of the scale. Following a review of recent available data below, this classification is at the higher end of market conditions:

Average Reported Armed Security Officer Compensation in Michigan

Source	Average
Zip Recruiter	\$18.00
Indeed	\$21.25
Glass Door	\$25.96
Talent.com	\$16.88



Jeff McBee
Human Resources Director
Telephone (734) 240-7251
Confidential Fax
(734) 240-7299

MONROE COUNTY

HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

125 East Second Street · Monroe, Michigan 48161- 2110
Telephone (734) 240-7295 · Fax (734) 240-7266 · Toll Free (888) 354-5500 Ext 7295

Sarah A. Boden
Human Resources Coordinator
Telephone (734) 240-7253
Confidential Fax
(734) 240-7276

Sierra Masson
Human Resources Assistant
Telephone (734) 240-7301
Confidential Fax
(734) 240-7302

Current Postings for County Courthouse Armed Security Positions

County	Wage
Eaton	\$19.00
Kalamazoo	\$25.46
Genesee	\$21.93
Kent	\$22.25

Based on the compensation amount adjustment, the approval of this classification would result in an additional appropriation from the General Fund of \$4,184.00 for the 2025 budget. I have included the job description, point factoring, financial impact summary, and the hiring review form for your review.

Your consideration of this request is appreciated and please feel free to contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Jeff McBee
Human Resources Director

HIRING REVIEW FORM

Department: Courthouse Security

Vacancy Job Title: Courthouse Security

Brief Job Description:

Provides security at the Monroe County Courthouse, including ensuring a weapon-free facility by monitoring and screening persons entering the courthouse. Coordinates with court bailiffs regarding daily activities of the facility and court operations and safety.

Budgeted Position:

☒ YES

If YES, are Funds Available?

☐ YES

* Must be verified by Finance/HR

☒ NO

*Must provide Funding Plan, verified by

☐ NO

If NO, please provide the following:

Job Description (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Point Factoring (Must have with New Position, Reclassification)

Reorganization Plan (When applicable)

Funding Plan Required, Verified by Finance (Include Finance Worksheet)

Department Summary: (Importance of filling vacancy, risks, timing, etc.)

By officially classifying the position on the wage scale, this will bring a degree of certainty for current and perspective employees, along with a recognition of continued service due to the introduction of increased compensation for time in the position.

Completed By: Jeff McBee, Human Resources Director

DATE: 3/27/25

Human Resources/ Finance Use:

Conclusion:

Finance: The reclassification of this position would require a projected additional General Fund appropriation of \$4,184.00.00 for 2025.

HR: The job description for this position has been point factored and classified at a Grade 8 on the non-union wage scale.

Finance Reviewer: Sue Maier

DATE: 3/27/25

HR Reviewer: Jeff McBee

DATE: 3/27/25

APPROVED BY THE OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

APPROVED BY THE FULL BOARD

Monroe County Part-time Courthouse Security Officer

<u>Department:</u>	<u>Courthouse Security</u>	<u>Wage Grade:</u>	<u>NA</u>
<u>FLSA Status:</u>	<u>Non-Exempt</u>	<u>Affiliation:</u>	<u>None</u>

General Summary:

Provides security at the Monroe County Courthouse, including ensuring a weapon-free facility by monitoring and screening persons entering the courthouse. Courthouse Security Officers are specialized professionals tasked with protecting courthouse visitors, litigants, jurors, witnesses and employees assigned to the courthouse through weapon screening, while exhibiting the highest degree of vigilance and professional customer service. Coordinates with court bailiffs regarding daily activities of the facility and court operations and safety. Serves as an emergency preparedness coordinator; assisting management to proactively develop plans to secure the courthouse during emergencies that may arise.

Essential Functions: *(An employee in this position may be called upon to do any of the following essential functions. These examples do not include all of the duties which the employee may be expected to perform. To perform this job successfully, an individual must be able to perform each essential function satisfactorily).*

- Serves as front line security for the Courthouse.
- Prevents unauthorized and dangerous items from entering the facility by screening all persons utilizing a weapon screening process which includes a walk through magnetometer, X-ray machine and hand held metal detectors.
- Ensures a safe and secure environment for all litigants, jurors, visitors and employees assigned to the courthouse; enforces courthouse policies and procedures.
- Deters unwanted activity within the facility. Uses two-way public safety portable radios to communicate with bailiffs and local law enforcement officers regarding unusual events or incidents within facility and coordinates activities.
- Monitors duress alarms and responds using defined protocol. Performs quarterly checks to ensure alarms are in working condition.
- Responds to emergency situations and evacuations.
- Provides customer service by dealing courteously and effectively with all types of people and behavior including disrespectful and abusive attitudes.
- Operates security screening station Monday through Friday 7:30 a.m. to 5:15 p.m. and as needed for scheduled evening meetings.
- Serves as an emergency preparedness coordinator. Assists management in developing emergency plans and employee training programs.
- Conducts monthly checks on AED and emergency kit supplies.

This list may not be inclusive of the total scope of job functions to be performed. Duties and responsibilities may be added, deleted or modified at any time.

Employment Qualifications:

Education: High school graduation or equivalent. Prefer MCOLES certified or retired law enforcement.

Experience: As law enforcement, military or armed security officer.

Other Requirements:

- Valid LEOSA Certificate and/or Michigan Exempt Concealed Pistol License (CPL).
- Must pass annual shooting proficiency.
- Ability to receive/pass first aid, CPR, AED, Bloodborne pathogens, fire extinguisher operations training.

Knowledge of:

- Electronic screening equipment.
- County/Court policies, procedures and strategies to promote effective local operations for the protection of people, data, property and institutions.
- Two-way radio communication.
- Human behavior and contraband detection.

Skill in:

- Communicating effectively and interacting with various types of people.
- Using sound judgment within established policy and procedural guidelines.
- Being aware of others' reactions and understanding why they react as they do.
- Using technology appropriate to the position held
- Establishing and maintaining effective working relationships with those contacted in the course of the work.

Ability to:

- Work a minimum of 9-hour days. May work as many as 12 hours in a day.
- Work well under pressure, prioritizing daily needs.
- Exercise independently and apply sound judgment in security situations to effect appropriate resolution.
- Recognize and avoid potentially hazardous situations.
- Analyze situations and determine proper responses.
- Perform many functions simultaneously.
- To tell when something is wrong or is likely to go wrong.
- Perform tasks requiring physical endurance and agility under adverse conditions.
- Use firearms safely and accurately.

The qualifications listed above are intended to represent the minimum skills and experience levels associated with performing the duties and responsibilities contained in this job description. The qualifications should not be viewed as expressing absolute employment or promotional standards, but as general guidelines that should be considered along with other job-related selection or promotional criteria.

Physical Requirements: *[This job may require the ability to perform any of the essential functions contained in this description. These may include, but are not limited to, the following requirements. Specific requirements for a job will be identified at the time of employment. Reasonable accommodations will be made for otherwise qualified applicants unable to fulfill one or more of these requirements]:*

While performing duties, the employee may regularly be required to stand or sit for long periods; walk long distances or go up and down stairs; hold or feel objects, tools or controls, reach with arms; hear, see and communicate with others. Employees work 9 to 12 hour days. Employee may be required to engage in extremely strenuous activity in subduing of violent individuals.

- Vision stamina and acuity to observe persons, places and things both close up and at a distance.
- Peripheral vision, depth perception and the ability to adjust focus.
- Hand and eye coordination and physical strength and dexterity to use hand gun.
- Hearing and speech sufficient to communicate in person or over the radio/telephone.
- Ability to distinguish sounds encompassing a full range of tones and volumes and hear conversations in noisy environments.

Working Conditions:

- May be in regular contact with persons charged and/or convicted of criminal offenses.
- May have occupational exposure to persons various communicable diseases.

New Grade Structure	Job Title Description	Education and Experience	Ed/ Ex #	Judgment and Independence	Internal and External Relations	Supervision	Sup #	Job Complexity	Responsibility for the Rights of Others	Technology	Impact on Programs, Services and Operations	Document Concentration	Work Environment	Total Points	Grade Point Parameters	Notes and Updates
8	Courthouse Security	243	b3	280	300	-	-	310	70	50	200	20	10	1483	1451-1600	

ITEM	DATE	Department	Union	Grade	Classification	WAGES	FRINGES	TOTAL
ANNUAL BUDGET	2025	26515	union_00	SECURITY	COURTHOUSE SECURITY	\$ 120,000	\$ 13,079	\$ 133,079
ACTUAL COST	THROUGH 5/1/25	26515	union_00	SECURITY	COURTHOUSE SECURITY	\$ 43,854	\$ 4,780	\$ 48,634
					REMAINING BUDGET	\$ 76,146	\$ 8,299	\$ 84,445
PROPOSED	EFFECTIVE 5/2/25	26515	union_00	RYE8	COURTHOUSE SECURITY	\$ 79,918	\$ 8,710	\$ 88,629
					TOTAL COST/(SAVINGS)	\$ 3,773	\$ 411	\$ 4,184
FINANCE CONCLUSION:								
ADDITIONAL COST TO GENERAL FUND, WOULD REQUIRE ADDITIONAL APPROPRIATION.								
ANNUAL PROPOSED	2025	26515	union_00	RYE8	COURTHOUSE SECURITY	\$ 129,868	\$ 14,154	\$ 144,022



MONROE COUNTY

FINANCE DEPARTMENT

125 East Second Street · Monroe, Michigan 48161-2197

Telephone: (734) 240-7250 · Fax (734) 240-7266

April 7, 2025

Mr. Henry Lievens, Chair
Operations Committee
125 East Second Street
Monroe, MI. 48161

Re: Michigan Indigent Defense-Monroe System Feasibility Study

Dear Chairman Lievens and Members of the Committee:

At your request, we have researched firms and/or organizations that are qualified to conduct or otherwise perform a feasibility analysis on the delivery system of criminal indigent legal services. Upon approval at the committee and board level, we will submit the request to the Regional Administrator of the Michigan Indigent Defense Commission for consideration.

The MIDC will determine if the request to conduct the analysis is approved. The request the County submits will include paying the cost of the analysis as an eligible cost qualifying it for reimbursement through MIDC grant funding. The MIDC Director has been engaged with the State and they have provided a list of firms qualified to undertake the feasibility analysis. Two firms have been engaged to provide proposals. We have received one proposal and expect the second proposal to be received by the afternoon of Tuesday, April 8th. Upon receipt, we will forward both proposals along with a summary recommendation. The proposed schedule to complete the analysis will have it finished no later than November of this year.

This analysis would be one component of a request to change the current delivery system in Monroe County. In the MIDC Grant Manual, the process for making any changes to the delivery system requires several steps and approvals. As written in the manual, “Any system seeking a substantial change to their compliance plan must contact their Regional Manager for guidance on that process, which will require a written request, justification for the change, and multi-level staff review prior to consideration by the Commission. Substantial changes to a compliance plan will not be recommended for approval to the Commission absent extraordinary circumstances.”

The manual further explains adjustments to approved plans or budgets, “While adjustments to the cost analysis will be necessary in many instances, there should be no substantial changes to the delivery system method set forth in the plan itself without prior approval from the Michigan Indigent Defense Commission. A “substantial change” is one that alters the method of meeting the objectives of the standard(s) in the approved plan. For example, a system with an approved plan for a public defender office that

would instead prefer to maintain a contract system would constitute a “substantial change” to the approved plan.”

April 2, 2025
Monroe-MIDC Feasibility Study
Page 2

Our next step then will be to write to our Regional Manager presenting the proposal to perform the system analysis and request approval to conduct the analysis. Inherent in the request will be approval to have the analysis accepted as an eligible expense to be funded through the MIDC grant. Once the analysis is completed, we will be informed by the outcome and recommendations as to next steps.

In the meantime, the FY2026 grant application is being prepared using the existing service delivery model as the compliance plan cost analysis that will be submitted to the MIDC by no later than April 25, 2025. The County’s application is being prepared using the MIDC grants manual guidance and will be on the April 15 Board agenda.

If you have any questions or desire any further information with respect to this matter, please contact me.

Sincerely,



Michael G. Bosanac
Administrator/Chief Financial Officer

Enclosure

MONROE COUNTY INDIGENT DEFENSE

Managing Attorney
Mary C. Gantz

Indigent Defense Coordinator
Melanie Young



District Court Attorneys
James Bartlett
Ronald J. Benore, Jr.
DavidMichael Bogard

125 E. Second Street
Monroe, MI 48161-2197
734.240.7634 FAX: 734.240.7385

MEMORANDUM

TO: Board of Commissioners

FROM: Mary C. Gantz

DATE: April 9, 2025

RE: Feasibility Study

Our office has received one complete proposal from The Sixth Amendment Center with a cost of \$50,076.00 to conduct the feasibility study of delivery models for criminal indigent defense services. The second company, the National Association of Public Defenders (NAPD), has been in contact with our office yesterday but have not yet submitted a proposal. After an explanation of what the office would require they gave a verbal estimate as a range from \$40,000-\$60,000. Their price would depend on how much travel their evaluators would incur while working on their analysis.

Both of these companies are capable of performing feasibility studies. They both have experience in this area of work. If you look at the Sixth Amendment Center proposal that will give you an idea of what the firms were asked to provide in the way of professional services.

Also, we interviewed Mr. Jonathan Sacks who was starting a consulting business to perform this work. He is the past director of the Michigan State Appellate Defender Office. However, this morning he wrote via email that he is no longer pursuing these services and withdraw his proposal to our office. Mr. Sack's proposal was not yet in writing when he withdrew his offer.

Our goal is to start the study as soon as possible. The Sixth Amendment Center said they may be able to start as soon as May. I feel this proposal from the Sixth Amendment Center is the superior firm to perform the analysis and accordingly recommend this firm. We would then transmit this to our Regional MIDC office to review and provide direction on proceeding.

Respectfully,

Mary C. Gantz
Administrator/Managing Attorney
Monroe County Indigent Defense



April 1, 2025

Mary Gantz
Administrator/Managing Attorney
125 E. Second St.
Monroe, MI 48161
mary_gantz@monroemi.org

Draft Public Defender Feasibility Study of Monroe County, Michigan Proposal

The **Sixth Amendment Center (6AC)** is a 501 (c)(3) non-profit, non-partisan organization seeking to ensure that no person accused of a crime goes to jail without first having the aid of a lawyer with the time, ability, and resources to present an effective defense as required under the United States Constitution. We do so by measuring indigent defense systems against Sixth Amendment case law and established standards of justice and then working with policymakers to improve any identified deficiencies.

The Monroe County Board of Commissioners is seeking an independent and objective public defender feasibility study to determine whether a public defender office is necessary in the county. This proposal explains how 6AC analyzes indigent defense systems to be able to provide the requested technical assistance.

I. Introduction

The Sixth Amendment to the U.S. Constitution states that in all criminal prosecutions, the accused shall enjoy the right, among others, to “have the Assistance of Counsel for his defence.”¹ In *Gideon v. Wainwright*, the U.S. Supreme Court declared it an “obvious truth” that anyone accused of a crime who cannot afford the cost of a lawyer “cannot be assured a fair trial unless counsel is provided for him.”² As the U.S. Supreme Court has noted, “[o]f all the rights that an accused person has, the right to be represented by counsel is by far the most pervasive, for it affects his ability to assert any other rights he may have.”³

Since *Gideon*, the Sixth Amendment right to counsel means every person is entitled to have an attorney provided at government expense whenever that person faces the potential loss of

¹ U.S. CONST. amend. VI.

² *Gideon v. Wainwright*, 372 U.S. 335, 344 (1963).

³ *United States v. Cronin*, 466 U.S. 648, 654 (1984). *See also* *Powell v. Alabama*, 287 U.S. 45, 68-69 (1932).

liberty and is unable to afford an attorney.⁴ In subsequent cases, the U.S. Supreme Court determined that the Sixth Amendment requires an appointed lawyer not only in felonies, but also in misdemeanors,⁵ misdemeanors with suspended sentences,⁶ direct appeals,⁷ and appeals challenging a sentence imposed following a guilty plea where the sentence was not agreed to in advance.⁸ Children in delinquency proceedings, no less than adults in criminal courts, are entitled to appointed counsel when facing the loss of liberty.⁹ Moreover, the appointed lawyer needs to be more than merely a warm body with a bar card.¹⁰ The attorney must be effective,¹¹ subjecting the prosecution's case to "the crucible of meaningful adversarial testing."¹²

In 2008, the U.S. Supreme Court reaffirmed in *Rothgery v. Gillespie County* that the right to counsel attaches when "formal judicial proceedings have begun."¹³ For a person who is arrested, the beginning of formal judicial proceedings is at "a criminal defendant's initial appearance before a judicial officer, where he learns the charge against him and his liberty is subject to restriction,"¹⁴ without regard to whether a prosecutor is aware of the arrest.¹⁵ The commencement of prosecution signals the beginning of formal judicial proceedings, "whether by way of formal charge, preliminary hearing, indictment, information, or arraignment."¹⁶ The Court carefully explained that "[o]nce attachment occurs, the accused at least is entitled to the presence of appointed counsel during any 'critical stage' of the post-attachment proceedings . . ."¹⁷ Examples of critical stages include arraignments,¹⁸ plea negotiations,¹⁹ and sentencing hearings.²⁰

The U.S. Supreme Court held that ensuring the Sixth Amendment right to effective assistance of counsel for the indigent accused in state courts is a constitutional obligation of the state – not

⁴ *Gideon v. Wainwright*, 372 U.S. 335 (1963).

⁵ *Argersinger v. Hamlin*, 407 U.S. 25 (1972).

⁶ *Alabama v. Shelton*, 505 U.S. 654 (2002).

⁷ *Douglas v. California*, 372 U.S. 353 (1963).

⁸ *Halbert v. Michigan*, 545 U.S. 605 (2005).

⁹ *In re Gault*, 387 U.S. 1 (1967).

¹⁰ *Strickland v. Washington*, 466 U.S. 668, 685 (1984) ("[t]hat a person who happens to be a lawyer is present at trial alongside the accused, however, is not enough to satisfy the constitutional command.)."

¹¹ *McMann v. Richardson*, 397 U.S. 759, 771 n.14 (1970).

¹² *United States v. Cronin*, 466 U.S. 648, 656 (1984).

¹³ *Rothgery v. Gillespie County*, 554 U.S. 191, 211 (2008); see also *Michigan v. Jackson*, 475 U.S. 625, 629 n.3 (1986); *Brewer v. Williams*, 430 U.S. 387, 388-89 (1977).

¹⁴ *Rothgery v. Gillespie County*, 554 U.S. 191, 213 (2008).

¹⁵ *Rothgery v. Gillespie County*, 554 U.S. 191, 194 (2008).

¹⁶ *Brewer v. Williams*, 430 U.S. 387, 398 (1977) (quoting *Kirby v. Illinois*, 406 U.S. 682, 689 (1972)); see also *Michigan v. Jackson*, 475 U.S. 625, 629 n.3 (1986).

¹⁷ *Rothgery v. Gillespie County*, 554 U.S. 191, 212 (2008).

¹⁸ *Hamilton v. Alabama*, 368 U.S. 52, 53-55 (1961).

¹⁹ *Lafler v. Cooper*, 566 U.S. 156, 165 (2012); *Padilla v. Kentucky*, 559 U.S. 356, 373 (2010); *McMann v. Richardson*, 397 U.S. 759, 771, 771 n.14 (1970).

²⁰ *Lafler v. Cooper*, 566 U.S. 156, 165 (2012); *Wiggins v. Smith*, 539 U.S. 510, 538 (2003); *Glover v. United States*, 531 U.S. 198, 203-04 (2001); *Mempa v. Rhay*, 389 U.S. 128, 134, 137 (1967).

local – government under the due process clause of the Fourteenth Amendment.²¹ When a state chooses to delegate its right to counsel responsibilities to its local governments, the state must guarantee not only that those local governments and local officials are capable of providing effective representation but also that they are in fact doing so.²²

II. Public Defense Services in Michigan

Michigan delegates to its county and municipal governments the responsibility for establishing and administering indigent defense systems to effectively represent indigent adults charged with crimes. The Michigan Indigent Defense Commission (MIDC) is an executive branch commission that provides oversight, promulgates and enforces minimum standards, and administers grant funding to local systems. Local governments must fund their “local share” of indigent defense but may not be required to fund more than their local share. The state funds MIDC’s operations as well as any cost of implementing MIDC’s standards in excess of each locality’s local share.

Local delivery & administration. Michigan law defines an indigent criminal defense system as the local governments that fund a trial court.²³ Under this definition, there is a separate indigent defense system for every judicial circuit court and every district court (and sometimes separate divisions of a district court). As of 2024, the state has 133 separate trial-level indigent defense systems.²⁴ Each system can determine its delivery model to ensure effective assistance of counsel to indigent defendants.²⁵ As of 2021, most systems provide services through assigned counsel panels or contracts with individual attorneys and nonprofit organizations; there are also 32 public defender offices covering 38 out of the state’s 83 counties.²⁶

²¹ *Gideon v. Wainwright*, 372 U.S. 335, 341-45 (1963) (“[T]hose guarantees of the Bill of Rights which are fundamental safeguards of liberty immune from federal abridgment are equally protected against state invasion by the Due Process Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment. . . . [A] provision of the Bill of Rights which is ‘fundamental and essential to a fair trial’ is made obligatory upon the States by the Fourteenth Amendment. . . . [R]eason and reflection require us to recognize that in our adversary system of criminal justice, any person haled into court, who is too poor to hire a lawyer, cannot be assured a fair trial unless counsel is provided for him. . . . The right of one charged with crime to counsel may not be deemed fundamental and essential to fair trials in some countries, but it is in ours.”).

²² *Cf. Robertson v. Jackson*, 972 F.2d 529, 533 (4th Cir. 1992) (although administration of a food stamp program was turned over to local authorities, “‘ultimate responsibility’ . . . remains at the state level.”); *Osmunson v. Idaho*, 17 P.3d 236, 241 (Idaho 2000) (where a duty has been delegated to a local agency, the state maintains “ultimate responsibility” and must step in if the local agency cannot provide the necessary services); *Claremont School Dist. v. Governor*, 794 A.2d 744 (N.H. 2002) (“While the State may delegate [to local school districts] its duty to provide a constitutionally adequate education, the State may not abdicate its duty in the process.”); Letter and white paper from American Civil Liberties Union Foundation *et al* to the Nevada Supreme Court, regarding Obligation of States in Providing Constitutionally-Mandated Right to Counsel Services (Sept. 2, 2008) (“While a state may delegate obligations imposed by the constitution, ‘it must do so in a manner that does not abdicate the constitutional duty it owes to the people.’”), http://www.nlada.net/sites/default/files/nv_delegationwhitepaper09022008.pdf.

²³ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.983(h) (West 2024).

²⁴ See MICHIGAN INDIGENT DEF. COMM’N, REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE FOR FY 2024, 5 (Sept. 2024).

²⁵ See MICH. INDIGENT DEF. COMM’N, ANNUAL IMPACT REPORT 6 (2021)

²⁶ See MICH. INDIGENT DEF. COMM’N, ANNUAL IMPACT REPORT 6, 14 (2021).

State & local funding: Each indigent defense system is required to maintain its “local share” of funding, which is defined as the system’s average annual expenditure in the three fiscal years immediately preceding the creation of the MIDC (2013).²⁷ Indigent defense systems are free to spend as much as they wish, but “must not be required to provide funds in excess of its local share.”²⁸

All state funding for indigent defense is financed through a state appropriation to the MIDC,²⁹ in two parts: one for the operation of MIDC and the other for the MIDC to distribute to the local governments through standard compliance grants. Under the statute, MIDC is required to provide funding to local governments when MIDC determines that the cost of compliance with MIDC standards exceeds a local government’s local share.³⁰ In other words, a local system's duty of compliance with MIDC standards is contingent upon receipt of a grant sufficient to cover the excess costs approved by MIDC.³¹

State oversight. MIDC, statutorily established in 2013,³² is an independent entity housed within the executive branch’s Department of Licensing and Regulatory Affairs (LARA) that oversees indigent defense services across the state.³³ MIDC is comprised of the supreme court chief justice (or designee) as the one non-voting member, and 18 voting members.³⁴ The commission members hire an executive director to head MIDC’s central office.³⁵ Subject to state appropriations, the executive director hires and supervises staff who carry out MIDC’s duties.³⁶ Among the staff are regional managers, who have primary responsibility for the local systems within a particular region of the state.

MIDC is charged with developing, implementing, and enforcing minimum standards on indigent defense service providers.³⁷ The standards approved by MIDC only take effect upon approval by LARA.³⁸ As of November 2023, MIDC has submitted, and LARA has approved, nine standards.³⁹

²⁷MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. §§ 780.993(7), 780.983(i) (West 2024).

²⁸ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. §§ 780.993(8) (West 2024).

²⁹ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. §§ 780.1002 (West 2024).

³⁰ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. §§ 780.989(1)(g), 780.993(7) through (16) (West 2024).

³¹ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.997(2) (West 2024).

³² MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.981 et seq. (West 2024).

³³ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.985(1), (2) (West 2024).

³⁴ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.987(1), (2) (West 2024).

³⁵ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.989 (1)(c) (West 2024).

³⁶ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.989 (1)(c), (d) (West 2024).

³⁷ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. §§ 780.985(3), 780.989(1)(a) (West 2024). *See also* MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.991 (West 2024) (listing the standards that the MIDC must establish, in line with ABA’s 10 Principles).

³⁸ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.985(4) (West 2024).

³⁹ *Standards*, MICHIGAN INDIGENT DEFENSE COMMISSION, <https://michiganidc.gov/standards/> (last visited Nov. 28, 2022). Standards 1–4 covering training and education of counsel, initial client interview, investigators and experts, and counsel at first appearance and other critical stages were approved by LARA in 2017; Standard 5 on independence from the judiciary was approved in 2020; the standard for indigency determination was approved in 2021; and standard 8 on attorney compensation was approved on Oct. 18, 2022. *Id.* Standards 6 and 7 on workloads and attorney qualifications were approved in October 2023. Implementation of standard 8 is expected in 2024; implementation of standards 6 and 7 is expected in 2025. MIDC, Annual Impact Report (2023), p. 11.

Within 180 days of LARA approving a new MIDC standard, local governments must submit a compliance plan to MIDC describing how they will comply with the standard and the cost of reaching compliance.⁴⁰ If the cost of implementing the standard exceeds the system's local share, MIDC must award the local government a grant to pay for the excess costs.⁴¹ Within 180 days of receiving funds from MIDC, the local government must bring its indigent defense system into compliance with the standards.⁴² MIDC is required to collect and report data about how each indigent defense system operates,⁴³ and every indigent defense system "shall" comply with MIDC's efforts.⁴⁴

Michigan law authorizes MIDC to take court action to enforce standard compliance by an indigent defense system.⁴⁵ If a court finds that an indigent defense system is in breach of its statutory "duty to comply" with MIDC standards, the court may "issue any orders necessary to obtain compliance."⁴⁶ If the system still refuses or fails to comply, the court can order MIDC to take over the delivery of indigent defense services in that jurisdiction and to bill the local government for its costs.⁴⁷

III. Public Defense Services in Monroe County

Monroe County has a population of 156,045 (ranking 15th highest in the state) and a land area of approximately 549 square miles. The county's median income is \$75,272, with a poverty rate of 11.3% (slightly lower than the state's poverty rate of 13.5%). There are 24 county subdivisions in Monroe County (15 townships, four cities, and five villages),⁴⁸ and the county seat is Monroe.

Prosecutions of all adult state crimes (felonies and misdemeanors) alleged to have been committed within the geographic boundaries of Monroe County occur in the 38th Circuit Court and the 1st District Court. Neither Monroe County nor any of its county subdivisions employ public defenders; indigent defense services are provided by approximately 26 private attorneys – four private attorneys as contractors who generally provide representation in misdemeanor cases, and 22 private attorneys on a roster who provide representation in all other case types.

⁴⁰ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.993(2), (3) (West 2024).

⁴¹ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.993(2), (4), (7) through (16) (West 2024).

⁴² MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.993(11) (West 2024).

⁴³ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. §§ 780.985(7), 780.989(1)(f), 780.993(5), (6) (West 2024).

⁴⁴ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.993(1) (West 2024).

⁴⁵ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. §§ 780.995(3), 780.997(3) (West 2024).

⁴⁶ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.995(4) (West 2024).

⁴⁷ MICH. COMP. LAWS ANN. § 780.995(5) through (7) (West 2024).

⁴⁸ Townships (Ash, Bedford, Berlin, Dundee, Erie, Exeter, Frenchtown, Ida, LaSalle, London, Milan, Monroe Raisinville, Summerfield, and Whiteford); Cities (Luna Pier, Milan, Monroe, and Petersburg); Villages (Carleton, Dundee, Estral Beach, Maybee, and South Rockwood). See Townships, Cities, & Villages in Monroe County, MONROE COUNTY, <https://co.monroe.mi.us/503/Township-Cities-Villages-in-Monroe-Count>.

IV. 6AC Evaluation Methodology, Budget & Timeline

For Monroe County to meet its right to counsel mandate, it must have a structurally sound system for ensuring that every indigent person receives an effective attorney at every critical stage. The U.S. Supreme Court explained in *United States v. Cronin* that a deficient indigent defense system can cause any lawyer – even the best lawyer – to be ineffective.

Under *Cronin*, the hallmarks of a structurally sound indigent defense system include the early appointment of qualified and trained attorneys who have sufficient time and resources to provide effective representation at every critical stage under independent supervision. These are the constitutional requirements of effective representation, which are consolidated into the American Bar Association's *Ten Principles of a Public Defense Delivery System*.

6AC independently and objectively evaluates indigent defense systems using Sixth Amendment case law and national standards for right to counsel services as the uniform baseline measurements for providing attorneys to indigent defendants, along with the requirements of state, local and federal laws. Although each indigent defense project is tailored to the specific needs of the jurisdiction being evaluated, our evaluations consist of, at a minimum:

- *Legal research and analysis.* Every state has its own substantive and procedural law through its constitution, statutes, rules, regulations, and case law. 6AC independently researches the relevant law of the jurisdiction and analyzes its internal interactions, and its interactions with federal law and national standards, to understand and explain the workings of the indigent defense system being evaluated.
- *Data collection and analysis.* Information about how a jurisdiction provides right to counsel services exists in a variety of forms, from statistical information to policies and procedures. 6AC obtains and analyzes extensive amounts of information.
- *Court observations.* Right to counsel services involve interactions among at least three critical processes: (1) the process a defendant experiences as their case advances from accusation through disposition; (2) the process the appointed attorney experiences while representing each person at the various stages of a case; and (3) the substantive laws and procedural rules that govern the justice system in which indigent representation is provided.
- *Interviews.* No individual component of the justice system operates in a vacuum. Rather, the policy decisions of one component necessarily affect another. Because of this, 6AC conducts interviews with a broad cross-section of stakeholders throughout the state and county.

Using each of these evaluation components, 6AC will provide written findings and recommendations on whether a public defender office is feasible in Monroe County.

TOTAL PROJECT BUDGET			\$50,076.00	
KICK-OFF PHASE			\$7,500.00	
	Expense Category	Projected Expenses		
Background Research & Advance Logistics			\$7,500.00	
	<i>Salaries: 5 days</i>	<i>\$ 7,500.00</i>		
SITE VISIT PHASE			\$24,576.00	
County	Expense Category	Projected Expenses		
Monroe County			\$24,576.00	
4 people @ 3 days	<i>Salaries (on-site & post-visit reporting)</i>	<i>\$ 18,000.00</i>		
	<i>M&IE: 3 days per person @ \$98</i>	<i>\$ 1,176.00</i>		
	<i>Transportation/parking to & from airports: \$80 ea.</i>	<i>\$ 320.00</i>		
	<i>Airfare: @ \$500 ea.</i>	<i>\$ 2,000.00</i>		
	<i>Hotel: 2 nights per person @ \$250 ea.</i>	<i>\$ 2,000.00</i>		
	<i>Rental Cars: 2 cars for 3 days ea. @ \$180 ea. (incl. insurance + gas)</i>	<i>\$ 1,080.00</i>		
REPORT WRITING PHASE			\$18,000.00	
	Expense Category	Projected Expenses		
Follow Up Interviews			\$1,500.00	
	<i>Salaries: 2 days</i>	<i>\$ 1,500.00</i>		
Drafting & Production			\$15,000.00	
	<i>Salaries: 10 days</i>	<i>\$ 15,000.00</i>		

TIMELINE							
2025							
	MAY	JUN	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV
Background research							
Legal research & analysis							
Data collection & analysis							
Interviews (virtual & in-person)							
Court obsv. (virtual & in-person)							
Report writing & production							

V. References

1. Lisa Kiem, State Senator of Maine
Lisa.Keim@legislature.maine.gov
(207) 418-2552

Maine was the only state in the country that provided all indigent defense services through private attorneys. Other states have moved away from using solely private attorneys because it

is difficult to predict and contain costs and difficult to provide quality oversight. The Maine Commission on Indigent Legal Services (MCILS) is tasked with overseeing indigent defense services, but undue political interference with MCILS resulted in underfunding. Moreover, MCILS was expected to oversee the representation by, and cost of, nearly 600 attorneys, handling more than 30,000 cases each year in 47 courthouses presided over by approximately 90 justices, judges, and magistrates – all with a staff of just three people.

Based on 6AC technical assistance, in 2018 Maine expanded the number and type of government officials authorized to appoint commission members to MCILS to comport with national standards on independence of the defense function. The same legislation authorized and funded a 6AC evaluation for the Maine Legislative Judiciary Committee.

6AC's 2019 evaluation, *The Right to Counsel in Maine*, recommended that Maine: (a) authorize and fund MCILS at a level sufficient to employ state government attorneys and support staff in a statewide appellate defender office and in a trial level public defender office; (b) enact a statutory ban on all contracts that create financial disincentive to effective representation; and (c) bar communications between prosecutors and unrepresented defendants.

MCILS subsequently banned all flat fee contracting, instituted better financial controls, implemented performance standards, and employed its first ever full-time public defenders to provide representation in rural areas that suffered from lawyer shortages.

2. Tom Boyd, Michigan State Court Administrator
boydt@courts.mi.gov
517-373-0128

Prior to 6AC's involvement, the responsibility for administering and funding trial-level indigent defense services in Michigan was a local government function. State government had no entity dedicated to determining whether the state's obligation to provide effective indigent defense services was being met by its counties and cities, and local government generally fell short of the mark due to excessive caseloads, no supervision, and undue political & judicial interference.

Based on 6AC's technical assistance, a Governor's Advisory Commission issued a 2012 report defining the state's indigent defense system as an "uncoordinated, 83-county patchwork quilt," with each county "dependent on its own interpretation of what is adequate" given limited local funding. In 2013, Michigan enacted a comprehensive legislative package creating the Michigan Indigent Defense Commission (MIDC) empowered to develop, monitor, and enforce standards statewide. Statutorily required standards include independence of the defense function; time sufficiency and workload controls; attorney/client confidentiality; attorney qualification, training, and supervision; and continuous representation. Local governments submit plans on how best to meet MIDC standards. If approved, the state is responsible for covering the difference between existing local funding and the amount to implement the standards.

In the first year of state funding, Michigan augmented local funding by more than double. MIDC standards led 32 of 83 counties to create public defender offices. Pre-reform there were just three public defender offices in the state.

VI. Prior Michigan County Evaluations

1. Oakland County, *Evaluation of Trial-Level Indigent Defense Services in Adult Criminal Cases* (October 2022): https://6ac.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/02/6AC_MI_OaklandCountyReport_10272022.pdf.
2. Wayne County, *Evaluation of Assigned Counsel Services in The Third Judicial District*, (August 2019): https://6ac.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/02/6AC_mi_waynecountyreport_2019.pdf.
3. Wayne County, *Evaluation of the State Defender Office of The Metropolitan Justice Center of Southeast Michigan* (April 2018): https://6ac.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/02/6AC_MI_waynecountyreport_2018.pdf.